Tolkien Fandom Review
1965

by
Sumner Gary Hunnewell
(Hildifons Took)

2010
**Table of Contents**

Dedication . . . . . 2  
From the Archives of Hildifons Took . . . . . 2  
A Short Overview of Tolkien Fandom in 1965 . . . . . 2  
   A Few Comments on the Fanzines Covered . . . . . 4  
   Fanzines . . . . . 5  
   Author index . . . . . 14  
   Artist index . . . . . 24  
   Art index by subject . . . . . 25  

Addenda (1956-1964) . . . . . 27  
   A Few Comments on the Fanzines Covered . . . . . 27  
   Fanzines . . . . . 27  
   Author index . . . . . 27  
   Ephemera . . . . . 28  
   Errata . . . . . 28  

Glossary . . . . . 29  
Bibliography . . . . . 29
Dedication

This installment is dedicated to Ed Meskys and Richard Plotz, who ushered in Tolkien fandom's original Golden Age. It is dedicated to the memory of Greg Shaw and Donald A. Wollheim.

From the Archives of Hildifons Took

The first installment of this project was sent without much explanation or fanfare. My desire to chronicle Tolkien fandom existed since my early days of fandom in the late 1970's. It has come in fits and starts. Originally, Tom Santoski and I had envisioned a Periodic Guide to Tolkien Literature but it never got past the 8” high stack of index cards, which I created. Spurred by the Tolkien centenary and on-going work with Marquette University brought about the Tolkien Year End Reviews in 1992 and 1993. The 1994 and 1995 years were started but never completed.

In a project like this, it is difficult to abstract evenly. An off-hand remark will be noted as would a literary criticism spanning many pages. Any misrepresentation of the original author's intent can be placed on me. I do not have the breadth of knowledge (literarily, politically, linguistically) needed sometimes to understand all nuances. Also, the nature of fanzines, APAZines, and genzines is that items will be missed or known fanzines with Tolkien content of which this author knows but either does not have the inclination or financial resources to obtain or fanzines that are lost to history / the trash heap. In the coming Tolkien Fandom Reviews, the Tolkien focused fanzines will outnumber science fiction fanzines considerably.

The reviews of the earlier installment were well received. This, of course, provides enough egoboo to spur on the 1965 version even earlier than I had expected.

A Short Overview of Tolkien Fandom in 1965

Soon after the publication of The Lord of the Rings in America, Donald A. Wollheim realized that the American editions carried no copyright notice. Although he admitted he was no devotee of Tolkien, he was a businessman and what he would do in 1965 would change the face of Tolkien fandom…

ACE Books did not break any laws when they produced their edition of The Lord of the Rings – without consent of its author. The British and American publishers, knowing that they had no legal right to sue, decided to try ACE’s editor, Donald A. Wollheim, in the court of public opinion. This included fanzines. Both Niekas and Yandro, two highly regarded and well-read fanzines, received letters from representatives of Tolkien’s publishers, George Allen & Unwin and Houghton Mifflin, resp. Fans came down on both sides of the argument but when blame was assessed it was put squarely on the shoulders of Houghton Mifflin, the copyright laws or both. Any coals heaped on the head of Wollheim seemed to come from people who were already on their way to ACE Books, shovels in hand. Wollheim rebutted all

---


2 Yandro won the best fanzine Hugo in 1965, Niekas followed two years later.
comers and published his own account in Terry Carr's fanzine, Lighthouse (Carr was a fan editor as well as a professional editor – at ACE Books).

Jack Gaughan's ACE edition covers brought mixed reactions. However, everyone (including Tolkien) was bewildered at Barbara Remmington's cover illustrations for the Ballantine editions of The Hobbit and The Lord of the Rings.

To fill the vacuum of I Palantir's anemic production and the quietness The Fellowship of the Ring, a young Los Angeles fan, Greg Shaw, published some Tolkien items in his genzine, Feemwlor. With David Hall of Missouri, he started Entmoot, a Tolkien fanzine independent from a club. Shaw seriously plumbed Tolkien's work by way of its Elvish linguistics and writing styles. It met with mixed reviews…as did most Tolkien discussion. There seemed to be little gray area. Either fans were excited by The Lord of the Rings or they could not understand what the hubbub was all about. Most of this discussion was set off by Al Halevy's Middle-earth glossary, which appeared in sequential issues of Niekas. The pages and pages of Tolkien character names and descriptions delighted some and baffled others. This year was the year of the “list makers” and there was a paucity of fiction or introspective and scholarly essays, which were common in the earliest days of Tolkien fandom.3

Prior to the uproar with ACE Books, Richard Plotz placed an advertisement in The New Republic, inaugurating the New York Tolkien Society (later, the Tolkien Society of America), which was totally outside of science fiction fandom.4 At that time, there were not many distinct author-based fandoms in the U.S. other than fans of Burroughs and Lovecraft. Within a few months, the Society had over 100 members.

Lest anyone think there is anything new under the sun, these are Tolkien fandom firsts published during this time:
- The taking of Tolkien fan names5,
- Question whether Balrogs had wings,
- Who was the Eldest, Bombadil or Treebeard?,
- Reports of people naming their children after Tolkien characters, and
- Elvish looks Finnish.

Tolkien fandom in 1966 would look a lot like 1965. It would start out on its own (outside of SF fandom), under the banner of The Tolkien Society of America...

A Few Comments about the Fanzines Covered

Most fanzines were created in limited quantities and are difficult to track down, so this (by no means) is a complete list of fanzines that contain Tolkien content (in some cases I have only a photocopy of a page or two). Much of the discussion appears in clubzines or APAs, which were a

---

3 Other Tolkien-named fanzines with no Tolkien content include Barad-dûr (Chalker), Barad-Dur (Klassen), The Hobbiton Herald (Johnstone), Lonely Mountain (Wells), and The Mirkwood (Klassen).
5 One might argue that Marion Zimmer Bradley was the first, using Elfrida Rivers, however this was a psuedonym (not a fannish name) used for her two “Arwen” stories in I Palantir.
common vehicle for distribution. However, some of these zines (for example, Niekas) could certainly stand on their own. Later in the 1960s, as science fiction fandom became less of an influence within Tolkien fandom, APAzines had negligible impact.

Often mimeographed and dittoed fanzines would use capital letters for titles or other artistic scripting. In cases like this, titles were standardized.

Here is a list of those fanzines covered and any affiliation (see the Glossary for additional information).

Amra. Published in Chicago, Illinois, by G. H. Scithers; independent.
Day*Star / Allerei. Published in Berkeley, California by Marion [Zimmer Bradley] and Walter Breen for FAPA.
Entmoot. Published in Crystal City, Missouri, San Bruno, California, by David Hall and Greg Shaw; independent.
Feemwlort. Published in San Bruno, California, by Greg Shaw, for N'APA.
Gallant Gallstone. Published in Los Angeles, California, by Jack Harness for APA L.
Grimoire. Published in Columbia, Missouri, by David Hall; independent.
Lighthouse. Published in Brooklyn, New York, by Terry Carr for FAPA.
maLAise. Published in New York by Dave Van Arnam for APA L.
Mallorn Leaf. Published by Barry Gold for APA F and APA L.
Niekas. Published in Livermore, California, Palo Alto, California, and Center Harbor, New Hampshire, by Ed Meskys and Felice Rolfe for N'APA.
O. Published by Dan Alderson for APA L.
PASTell. Published in Garden Grove, California, by John Trimble and Al Lewis for Project Art Show.
Ratatosk. Published in Los Angeles, California, by Bruce Pelz; independent.
Ring Cycle. Published by Dick Eney; independent.
Sagana. Published in Brooklyn, New York, by John Boardman for APA L.
Voice From A Hot Water Bottle. Published in Burbank, California, by Phil Castoria for APA L.
Yandro. Published in Hartford City, Indiana, by Robert and Juanita Coulson; independent.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Fanzines

♫ 1965 ♫

PASTell 17 (January 1965)
[Trimble, Bjo?]. “Art Show Awards - 1964.” 6-7. Fellowship of the Ring award given at the Worldcon had honorable mentions given to Cawthorn and Stopa (Stopa was also fifth in the Popular Award voting for another Tolkien piece).
Lewis, Al. “Pacificon II Art Show Report.” 8-11. Mentions that Stopa’s artwork is showing more freedom in the Tolkien art displayed at Worldcon.
Unknown. Untitled. 16. Photo of Joni Stopa with her Lothlorien art as it appeared at the 1964 Worldcon.
Johnson, Barbi. “This ‘n That - letters of comment.” 22. LoC. Has not read Tolkien but will borrow the books from Andre Norton.

Voice From A Hot Water Bottle 4 (January 1965)
Castoria, Phil. Untitled. 2. APA comments on Opo [27?] Tolkien’s writing provides more than a story with a climax as he continues the story to a satisfying, complete ending.

♫ 4 (January 14, 1965)
Alderson, Dan. Untitled. 1. States that he wrote an article on Tolkien’s cirth in Wibble Scribble #27. Tolkien quoted in Elliott’s Runes.

maLAise 12 (January 18, 1965)
Van Arnam, Dave. Untitled. 2. Wants to join The Fellowship of the Ring and is annotating Tolkien’s books.

Gallant Gallstone 14 (January 21, 1965)
Harness, Jack. “A Four Pound Bag of Wet Mice.” 2. APA comments on CATS: describes The Silmarillion, which could be published in three volumes.

Sagana 8 (February 22, 1965)

Mallorn Leaf [no number] (March? 1965)
Gold, Barry D. Untitled. 1-2. Sets the ballad of Gil-Galad to voice and lyre.

Niekas 11 (March 15, 1965)
Frederick, Carl. “Dissent into the Maelstrom (Kiribil?).” 11. Poem displaying a humorous dislike of LR.
Unwin, R.S. Untitled. 40. Explains that The Silmarillion is in an unpublishable state and years away from completion but Tolkien’s English version of “Sir Gawain and the Green Knight” and “Pearl” might be published by year’s end.
Singleton, Peter. “Laiskai.” 59. LoC. Finds Halevy’s glossary an academic exercise. Finished reading The Hobbit and hopes LR provides a more profound experience.
Harrell, Phillip A. “Laiskai.” 64-65. LoC. Finds Halevy’s glossary invaluable and would like to see it published in book form.
Viggiano, Michael. “Laiskai.” 65. LoC. Likes de Maifee’s Gimli drawing from Niekas 10 but Halevy’s glossary puts him off reading LR.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Warner, Jr., Harry. “Laiskai.” 69. LoC. Finds in Niekas 10 that de Maiffe’s drawing of Gimli better than most Tolkien art but finds Zelazny’s poem emotionless. Remarks that the dwarvish name Nain is also French for dwarf.


Mebane, Banks. “Laiskai.” 70-71. LoC. Provides corrections to Halevy’s glossary on dwarves and feels Halevy takes some liberties. Wishes to see it as a published book.

Heap, Cindy. “Laiskai.” 73. LoC. Suggests that “Leaf by Niggle” be nominated for the short fiction Hugo.


Mebane, Banks. “Laiskai.” 70-71. LoC. Provides corrections to Halevy’s glossary on dwarves and feels Halevy takes some liberties. Wishes to see it as a published book.

Heap, Cindy. “Laiskai.” 73. LoC. Suggests that “Leaf by Niggle” be nominated for the short fiction Hugo.


Mebane, Banks. “Laiskai.” 70-71. LoC. Provides corrections to Halevy’s glossary on dwarves and feels Halevy takes some liberties. Wishes to see it as a published book.

Heap, Cindy. “Laiskai.” 73. LoC. Suggests that “Leaf by Niggle” be nominated for the short fiction Hugo.


Mebane, Banks. “Laiskai.” 70-71. LoC. Provides corrections to Halevy’s glossary on dwarves and feels Halevy takes some liberties. Wishes to see it as a published book.

Heap, Cindy. “Laiskai.” 73. LoC. Suggests that “Leaf by Niggle” be nominated for the short fiction Hugo.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Feemwelt 2 (June 1965)

Shaw, Greg. “Addendum.” 16. Editorial ramblings about a party where the first paperback FR was seen and Tolkien music performed at the piano.

Boston, John. “Skod Skudgy.” 20. LoC. Has not read Tolkien and has no desire to do so.


Shaw, Greg. “A Dictionary of the Elven Words from J.R.R. Tolkien’s Lord of the Rings.” 31-44. List of songs, sayings, and elvish words and roots (a - lyg), including proper names with their translations, if known.

Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965)


West, R.C. “Laiskai.” 65. LoC. Has not read Tolkien and has no desire to do so.


Brown, Charlie. “Laiskai.” 70-71. LoC. Disappointed that The Silmarillion will not be published soon and hopes to see Halevy’s glossary published.


Perrin, Steve. “Laiskai.” 72. LoC. Originally put off of LR by Carter’s articles in Xero but finds LR more readable than Moorcock.

Wood, Robin. “Laiskai.” 73. LoC. Does not like Reynolds’ orcs but prefers his brother’s found in I Palantir 4.

Coulson, Robert. “Laiskai.” 73. LoC. Cannot understand why anyone would bother with a glossary of Middle-earth, finding the whole exercise unnecessary.


Mebane, Banks. “Laiskai.” 74. LoC. Has never found any appropriate rendering of an orc in artwork. Feels that Halevy’s glossary is less rushed but points out issues with it.

Westbrooke, Horace “Laiskai.” 75-76. LoC. Finds Halevy’s glossary kooky.

Shaw, Greg. “Laiskai.” 76. LoC. Responds to Frederick’s poem with one of his own for people who dislike Tolkien.

Meskys, Ed. “Bumbejimas: Of Tolkienish Things.” 77-78. Report on the ACE paperbacks (Wollheim was interviewed at a party). Wollheim speculated that the British publishers did not ‘register’ LR within the prescribed 18-month window and so lost copyright. Don Benson of Pyramid books asked Houghton Mifflin for years for paperback publication rights but was turned down, possibly because Houghton Mifflin knew they had no rights to sell. ACE did not plan to pay royalties. ACE plans on LR being a prestige book, published indefinitely, allowing them access to more markets (such as college bookstores). Comments on Gaughan’s covers. News of the New York Tolkien Society.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Yandro 149 (July 1965)
Shir-Cliff, Bernard. “Grumblings.” 23. LoC. Ballantine Books representative explains that Tolkien’s copyrights were unprotected due to a loophole in the U.S. copyright law, Tolkien receives no royalties on the ACE editions of LR, and Ballantine and Houghton Mifflin will be publishing an authorized, revised edition at the latter part of 1965.
Coulson, Robert S. “Strange Fruit.” 20-22. Includes fanzine reviews of Feemwlort 2 (mentions elvish dictionary) and Mathom 3.

Ratatosk 17 (July 25, 1965)

Feemwlort 3 (August 1965)
Shaw, Greg. “Con-nizerings or Don’t Go Near the Edgewater or Tom Swift and His Electronic Westercon XVII.” 7-19. Con report. Includes references to Tolkien inspired art in the art show and Simpson’s scheme of writing tengwar (see Entmoot 2).
Warner, Harry. “Skod Skudgy.” 27-28. LoC. Suggests that those who work on Tolkien linguistics to send their efforts to Tolkien. Wonders if Tolkien’s languages are synthetic or adapted. Thinks elvish looks Finnish.
Mebane, Banks, and Greg Shaw. “Skod Skudgy.” 33-33 1/3. LoC. Shaw’s dictionary shows how Tolkien’s languages have inner consistency. Surmises that Tolkien created grammars and dictionaries. Discusses the Sindarin/Quenya words for ‘man’ (adan/atan). Shaw replies that much of Tolkien’s languages are untranslatable.
Stevens, Milton F., and Greg Shaw. “Skod Skudgy.” 33 2/3. LoC. A new reader of LR and is surprised at the Tolkien fan scholarship. Suggests that Tolkien fans explore Anglo-Saxon literature for sources. Shaw responds that many of Tolkien’s names have Anglo-Saxon sources.
Viggiano, Michael. “Skod Skudgy.” 34. LoC. Feels that all of the in-depth attention of LR will scare away potential readers.

Lighthouse 13 (August 1965)
Wollheim, Donald A. “The Ace Tolkiens.” 16-18. Justification over the ACE editions of LR. Knew that the books carried no copyright originally (but later carried the Berne copyright after, which did not apply in the U.S.). Blames Tolkien’s publisher or agent that allowed this to happen. ACE and other paperback publishers requested paperback rights from Houghton Mifflin, but were refused. ACE decided to publish them after the success of (and copyright research resulting from) publishing of the Edgar Rice Burroughs paperback editions. States that ACE will pay Tolkien and feels that Tolkien will come out better in the end with increased prestige and income.
Caughran, Jim. “Letter Litter.” 34. LoC. Feels that Tolkien has no place in a discussion of science fiction.

Yandro 150 (August 1965)
Coulson, Robert S. “Rumblings.” 4-5. Editorial which describes the Ballantine edition of The Hobbit and continues to praise it as one of the best juvenile fantasies ever written.
Briney, Bob. “Grumblings.” 18-19. LoC. Westercon report where the ACE paperbacks of LR were discussed, including reference to the loss of copyright in the U.S.
Wollheim, Don A. “Grumblings.” 19. LoC. Takes exception of Shir-Cliff’s comments on the ACE paperbacks of LR. Notes that the books aren’t pirated since they were not copyrighted in the U.S. and Houghton Mifflin was contacted before by publishers to issue editions in paperback. Tolkien offered royalties or an honorarium by ACE and that the additional cost of the Ballantine edition cannot be justified by stating that they pay royalties.
Shir-Cliff, Bernard. “Grumblings.” 19-20. LoC. Discusses the grassroots firestorm due to the ACE editions. Tolkien’s illness had delayed the publication of the Ballantine editions of LR but The Hobbit was published.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Grimoire 1 ([September?] 1965)

Ring Cycle ([September] 1965)
Heap, George “An Epical Historie of the War of the Ring.” 2. Filk song. The history of the One Ring set to the tune of “Jesse James.”
[Eney, Dick?] Untitled. 3. Poem or filk song about Sauron’s creation of the One Ring.
[Eney, Dick?] “High Fly the Nazgûl - O.” 4-5. Filk song. LR themed to the tune of “Green Grow the Rushes, O.”
[Eney, Dick?] Untitled. 5. Poem. Describes Ursdes and compares them to science fiction fans.

Yandro 151 (September 1965)
Coulson, Robert S. “Strange Fruit.” 13-16. Fanzine reviews, includes Entmoot 1 (fanzine of Tolkien esoterica) and Feemuelott 3 (elvish dictionary).
Berman, Ruth. “A Round of Cards and Ale.” 33. LoC. Feels the ACE issue was due to Houghton Mifflin’s blunders and the U.S. copyright law.
Brooks, Rick. “A Round of Cards and Ale.” 33. LoC. Sides with Ballantine Books, considers LR the best novel, suggests that Houghton Mifflin did not offer paperback rights because that publisher would have to pay royalties (where another would not).
Briney, Robert E. “A Round of Cards and Ale.” 33. LoC. Chose to purchase the ACE LR due to price although will probably buy the Ballantine edition for the extra material.
Dorr, James. “A Round of Cards and Ale.” 34. LoC. Would be surprised if Tolkien was upset over the loss of some royalties. Feels Ballantine will produce a better constructed paperback.
Tacket, Roy. “A Round of Cards and Ale.” 34. LoC. Indifferent about ACE/Ballantine controversy. Had to order copies of LR because they were unavailable in Albuquerque.
Coulson, Robert S. “A Round of Cards and Ale.” 34. LoC. Places blame on Houghton Mifflin, which should have understood U.S. copyright laws, and ACE did Tolkien a service insomuch that he is receiving royalties from Ballantine.

Ratatosk 19 (September 2, 1965)
Felz, Bruce. “The Tolkien Society of America.” 1. Meeting announcement, which includes the troubles with ACE Books and the publication of The Silmarillion. Bill Mallardi planned to publish a booklet of Tolkien’s songs and poems from The Hobbit and LR.

Niekas 13 (September 15, 1965)
Fry, Norman. “Tolkien & British Culture.” 13-14. Wonders if Tolkien’s LR will last as an icon of English Literature. Feels Tolkien’s appeal lies in his ability to make the flavor old Northern European tales accessible to a modern Eurocentric audiences. Mentions a story in New Worlds SE by Bayley, which derives from Tolkien.
Gaughan, Jack. “Laiskai.” 38. LoC. Apologizes for the cover of the ACE TT (flying horse) due to time pressure to finish the illustration.
Viggiano, Michael. “Laiskai.” 40. LoC. Finally read LR but does not have use for Halevy’s or Shaw’s glossaries. Found ACE LR in sf/fantasy as well as literature section of a college bookstore. Heard that there was a Tolkien cult at Harvard.
Jackson, Pete. “Laiskai.” 40. LoC. Has started reading LR along with his father.
Anthony, Piers. “Laiskai.” 41-42. LoC. Finds LR inferior to Burton’s translation of The Book of the Thousand Nights and a Night. Not sure he will buy the ACE LR since Tolkien is not paid.
de Camp, L. Sprague. “Laiskai.” 42. LoC. Wants all installments of Halevy’s glossary. Wrote to Tolkien, who “sounded weary, depressed, and averse to penpalmanaship.”
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Bisenieks, Dainis. “Laiškai.” 39. LoC. Finds the glossary of interest but wishes it could include items known by Tolkien but not published.

Entmoot 2 (October 1965)
Mebane, Banks, and Greg Shaw. “Amon Lhaw.” 3-4. LoC. Comments on impressions of music set to Tolkien’s poems (hobbits: German drinking songs; elves: Schubert lieder), character names are letters of the alphabet spelled phonetically, phonetic use of tengwar, criticism of Shaw’s poem for historical accuracy. Shaw responds about Bradley’s and Johnstone’s musical settings, possible Elvish instruments, and adaptability of folksongs to Tolkien’s poems.
Frazier, Leroy. “Amon Lhaw.” 4. LoC. Attempts to understand the context of “The breaking of Thangorodrim and the defeat of Morgoth.”

Hollander, Fred. “Amon Lhaw.” 5-6. LoC. Comments on the quality of Entmoot 1, elvish dictionaries, musical settings, and instruments used by elves, dwarves, men, and hobbits, and problems with film production of LR.
Brooks, Cuyler Warnell “Ned”. “Amon Lhaw.” 7-8. LoC. Comments on Entmoot 1, hobbits having higher pitched voices, Heap’s musical setting of “A Elbereth Gilthoniel,” surmises elvish music lacks emotion, Sauron is derived from the Greek for lizard, Tolkien’s art looks to be influenced by Beardsley, news of paperback The Hobbit published on August 5th, and news of the Tolkien Society of America.


Yandro 152 (October 1965)
McCallum, John A. “Grumblings.” 23. LoC. States that British editions of Tolkien can be purchased in Canada or through importers.
Norwood, Rick. “Grumblings.” 24. LoC. Writes about his 1938 edition of The Hobbit and compares it to the new Houghton Mifflin edition. At the 1965 Worldcon it was stated that The Silmarillion was already written but continues to be rewritten.
Goodrich, James. “Another Round of Cards and Ale…….” 29. LoC. Thinks that Wollheim should have worked with Tolkien personally to procure paperback rights.
Norwood, Rick. “Another Round of Cards and Ale…….” 29. LoC. Agrees with Wollheim, if ACE had not published the paperback editions, someone else would and that blame should be placed with Houghton Mifflin.
Bensen, Don. “Another Round of Cards and Ale…….” 29. LoC. [Begging forgiveness for an editor’s whim] “I suggested to Ballantine that, while they were waiting for their own Tolkiens, they distribute a poster to bookstores showing JRRT looking pathetic (maybe smoking a pipe mended with tape), with a big caption: CAN’T YOU WAIT? They didn’t do it, though.”
Norwood, Rick. “Another Round of Cards and Ale…….” 29. LoC. Will not buy the ACE editions new out of deference to Tolkien but still is thankful that ACE forced the books to be published as paperbacks.
West, D. “Another Round of Cards and Ale…….” 29-30. LoC. Finds Houghton Mifflin to blame about the copyright loss. An academic question in Britain as the only LR editions available are the normal and deluxe.
Sieger, James. “Another Round of Cards and Ale…….” 30. LoC. Says Wollheim has explained his actions in The New York Times Book Review and his offer for royalty/honorarium was not answered by Tolkien.
Sarno, Joe. “Another Round of Cards and Ale…….” 30. LoC. Thinks that the contributors to the last issue’s column on the ACE/Ballantine controversy do [not] have Houghton Mifflin editions.
Beach, Herb. “Another Round of Cards and Ale…….” 30. LoC. Purchased ACE LR because it was published first and will buy the first paperback Hobbit, either ACE or Ballantine.
Coulson, Robert S. “Another Round of Cards and Ale…….” 30. LoC. Owns the George Allen & Unwin editions of LR.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Ratatosk 22 (October 24, 1965)

Yandro 153 (November 1965)
White, Ted. “Grumblings.” 15-20. LoC. Responds to Wollheim’s criticism of White’s criticism of Wollheim. Brings up the topic of the ACE LR and believes that Wollheim never offered an honorarium to Tolkien or his representatives.
Rolfe, Felice. “Grumblings.” 20. LoC. Has good things to say about Shaw and his Entmoot. Finds the tit-for-tat between Wollheim and his detractors hilarious.
Sarno, Joe. “Grumblings.” 21. LoC. Feels LR is the most ambitious work of fantasy and compares to Wright’s Islandia.

Feemwlort 4 (December 1965)
Toren, James. “Skodskudgy.” 13. LoC. After reading The Hobbit and LR, does not understand how anyone could hate the books.
Brooks, Jr., Cuyler Warnell. “Skodskudgy.” 15. LoC. Not impressed with the cover of Feemwlort 3 of Éowyn and the Nazgûl.
Bucklin, Nate. “Skodskudgy.” 15-16. LoC. Would like to see research done on the Angerthas.
Evers, E.E. “A Man’s Farewell to the Elvenlords.” 20. Poem written about a man’s ambivalence at the passing of the Elves from Middle-earth.

Tolkien Journal 2 (Winterfilth 1965)
Plotz, Richard “The ACE Books Controversy.” 1-2. Discussion of the ACE editions with a quote from Tolkien on the copyright situation. ACE offered an honorarium to Tolkien. Describes the advantage of the Ballantine Books over the ACE editions.
Plotz, Richard “The Silmarillion.” 2. The need by Tolkien to create the second edition of LR delayed the publication of The Silmarillion. The publication of the Akallabêth is possible.
Plotz, Richard “Tolkien Notes from All Over.” 3. Bits and pieces: Brandywine Mushrooms, Dick Tedhams names his dog Samwise and daughter Arwen Elanor, a fanzine index planned, brother of the editor thinks he is Thorin, Bob Foster is working on a Tolkien index, Friends of J.R.R. Tolkien group formed, Esquire names Tolkien one of the best 100 people in the world, quote from Tolkien asking someone to explain why the Ballantine covers look the way they do.
Plotz, Richard “Articles for Future Issues.” 3. Appeal for material on Tolkien and other authors.

Yandro 154 (December 1965)
Coulson, Robert S. “Rumblings.” 4-5. Editorial which questions whether LR will be eligible for a Hugo now that it was published in paperback.
Dominick, Margaret “Wanted in trade.” 10. Reader wants to trade for paperback LR.
Sarno, Joe. “Grumblings.” 18-19. LoC. Errata to his letter in Yandro 153. Describes meeting with Ackerman after the 1957 Worldcon where Ackerman showed 200 slides of landscapes and illustrations to be used as background to LR movie.
Wollheim, Donald A. “Grumblings.” 19-20. LoC. Notes that Tolkien and his publishers never mentioned money in their complaints to ACE but that ACE did not inform them ahead of time. Writes that in a BBC interview Tolkien stated he would turn down money from ACE. Feels that the Unwins had no faith in Tolkien’s work, which accounted for the need for Tolkien to underwrite LR and, therefore, would not cover the cost to maintain its copyright.
Isaac, John R. “Grumblings.” 20-21. LoC. Remembers reading in a past fanzine that Wollheim would not publish LR because it would not be economically feasible.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Beach, Herb. “Grumblings.” 21-22. LoC. Purchased ACE LR because it was published first and will buy the first paperback Hobbit, either ACE or Ballantine. Feels Wollheim answered critics.

Boland, John. “Grumblings.” 22-23. LoC. Dislikes the look of the Ballantine editions of LR as much as ACE.

Solon, Ben. “Grumblings.” 23-24. LoC. Feels Wollheim was within his rights to publish LR but doesn’t like the quality of the editions or the incorrect page references in footnotes. Feels that Tolkien was more interested in the courtesy of being informed than the money “…anyone who takes fifteen years to write a novel is not in it for the money…”

Nieka 14 (December 10, 1965)


Evers, E.E. “Morgul Vale.” 34. Poem describing the flow of bracken water coming from the Morgul Vale.

Anderson, Poul. “The Paperback Tolkien: 1. The morality of the Ace edition—-.” 37. States the copyright situation was known to publishers in the past but not exploited by them. Informed his (Anderson’s) agent not to have ACE reprint or publish any of his books.


Evers, Earl. “Gincas.” 53-54. LoC. Comments on Fry’s article in Nieka 13. Sees Tolkien’s personal philosophy as related in the history of Middle-earth as something to be avoided when evaluating pillars of English literature. Tolkien’s Eurocentric and anti-technological model are outdated and are modern failures. Tolkien’s gods have all but abandoned Middle-earth as the elves are meant to do, leaving Men to their own devices.

Braude, Nan. “Gincas.” 54-55. LoC. Takes exception to Evers LoC in this issue. Does not find traditional cultural view evil unless they are bigoted. Defends an anti-mechanical philosophy whenever machines become more important than the individual. Uses Tolkien’s Beowulf lecture to show heroism in the fate of doom. States Tolkien’s elves and gods cannot be held accountable for the transgressions of men. Elves have no alliance or allegiance to men unless it suits their common needs.


Evers, Pfc. Earl E. “Laiskai.” 58-59. LoC. Cover of Nieka 12 inspires short prose touching on Numenor under the Sea. Offers correction for Halevy’s entry for Gríma. Thinks that wizards should be included in the entries of men (as Smeagol would be with the hobbits). Became a Tolkien fan after reading The Hobbit but its effect is very different than planned for a child reader.


Mebane, Banks. “Laiskai.” 60. LoC. Makes corrections to the Halevy glossary and states that the glossary is simply for the enjoyment of Tolkien fans.

Luc, Rick. “Laiskai.” 61. LoC. Appreciates the hard work put into Halevy’s glossary.


Charter, George. “Laiskai.” 62. LoC. Does not like LR and has no use for Halevy’s glossary. Suggests that Tolkien must have created his own glossary, which could be published.

Brooks, Rick. “Laiskai.” 62. LoC. Wonders if Moorcock was influenced by Tolkien and briefly compares the fighting of evil between the two.

Halevy, Al. “Laiskai.” 63. LoC. Provides history of his Middle-earth glossary as well as his motivation and justification to create it. Responds to corrections by Mebane, Mercer, Berman and others.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Perrin, Steve. “Laiskai.” 63-64. LoC. Fry’s article in Niekas 13 has not much to say. The noble hero is an uncommon concept outside of the medieval chivalrous ideal. Does not find parallels between LR and Norse/Arthurian legends, which are dark and deadly.

Warner, Jr., Harry. “Laiskai.” 64. LoC. Tolkien will not cause people to be interested in older tales. LR will blend into the background and will not be one of the century’s most influential books.

Mandel, Mark. “Laiskai.” 65. LoC. Uses the first five tengwar as members.


Solon, Ben. “Laiskai.” 66. LoC. Does not agree with Fry that Tolkien had any underlying philosophical motive when writing LR. Finds it incredulous that LR was not influenced by World War II. The hobbits are the only creatures that have commonality with modern man.

de Camp, L. Sprague. “Laiskai.” 66. LoC. Happy to have all installments of Halevy’s glossary. Reiterates his statement about Tolkien’s letter but includes bereavement as a reason for Tolkien’s moroseness.

Hall, Graham M. “Laiskai.” 66. LoC. Does not see Tolkien as a myth maker as myths come from an oral tradition. Admires Tolkien’s craft as a writer.


Maske, S. “Laiskai.” 66. LoC. Tells of daughter who found LR frightening but (after reading it) found that all other stories are dull.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Author index

Alderson, Dan
Untitre[d. 4 (January 14 1965): 1. States that he wrote an article on Tolkien's cirth in Wibble Scribble #27. Tolkien quote in Elliott's Runes.

Anderson, Poul
“‘The Paperback Tolkien: 1. The morality of the Ace edition…’” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 37. States the copyright situation was known to publishers in the past but not exploited by them. Informed his (Anderson’s) agent not to have ACE reprint or publish any of his books.

Anthony, Piers
“Laiskai.” Niekas 13 (September 15, 1965): 41-42. LoC. Finds LR inferior to Burton’s translation of The Book of the Thousand Nights and a Night. Not sure he will buy the ACE LR since Tolkien is not paid.

Beach, Herb
“Another Round of Cards and Ale…..” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 30. LoC. Purchased ACE LR because it was published first and will buy the first paperback Hobbit, either ACE or Ballantine.

“Grumblings.” Yandro 154 (December 1965): 21-22. LoC. Purchased ACE LR because it was published first and will buy the first paperback Hobbit, either ACE or Ballantine. Feels Wollheim answered critics.

Bensen, Don
“Another Round of Cards and Ale…..” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 29. LoC. [Begging forgiveness for an editor’s whim.] “I suggested to Ballantine that, while they were waiting for their own Tolkiens, they distribute a poster to bookstores showing JRRT looking pathetic (maybe smoking a pipe mended with tape), with a big caption: CAN’T YOU WAIT? They didn’t do it, though.”

Berman, Ruth
“A Round of Cards and Ale.” Yandro 151 (September 1965): 33. LoC. Feels the ACE issue was due to Houghton Mifflin’s blunders and the U.S. copyright law.

“Judges’ Reports.” PASTell 17 (January 1965): 12-13. Felt that Stopa’s Lothlorien art in the art show did not raise to a winners category for the Fellowship of the Ring award.


Bibby, George A.
“Laiskai.” Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965): 66. LoC. Read LR seven or eight times. Finds Tolkien’s hobbits reflect the country British of World War II.

Bigglestone, Clint

Bisenieks, Dainis
“Laiskai.” Niekas 13 (September 15, 1965): 39. LoC. Finds the glossary of interest but wishes it could include items known by Tolkien but not published.


Boardman, John


Boland, John
“Grumblings.” Yandro 154 (December 1965): 22-23. LoC. Dislikes the look of the Ballantine editions of LR as much as ACE.

Boston, John
“Skodskudgy.” Feemwlort 2 (June 1965): 20. LoC. Has not read Tolkien and has no desire to do so.

Bradley, Marion Zimmer

“Kennst du das Never-Never Land.” Day*Star 26 / Allerei 11 (May 1965): 2-4. The move to California evokes a feeling of nostalgia. Discusses how this feeling unlocked the ability to write music for “Galadriel’s Lament.”
Braude, Nan
“Gincas.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 54-55. LoC. Takes exception to Evers LoC in this issue. Does not find traditional cultural view evil unless they are bigoted. Defends an anti-mechanical philosophy whenever machines become more important than the individual. Uses Tolkien’s Beowulf lecture to show heroism in the fate of doom. States Tolkien’s elves and gods cannot be held accountable for the transgressions of men. Elves have no alliance or allegiance to men unless it suits their common needs.

Breen, Walter


Briney, Bob
“Grumblings.” Yandro 150 (August 1965): 18-19. LoC. Westercon report where the ACE paperbacks of LR were discussed, including reference to the loss of copyright in the U.S.

Briney, Robert E.
“A Round of Cards and Ale.” Yandro 151 (September 1965): 33. LoC. Chose to purchase the ACE LR due to price although will probably buy the Ballantine edition for the extra material.

Brooks, Cuyler Warnell. See also Brooks, Jr., Cuyler Warnell; Brooks, Ned
“Amon Lhaw.” Entmoot 2 (October 1965): 7-8. LoC. Comments on Entmoot 1, hobbits having higher pitched voices, Heap’s musical setting of “A Elbereth Gilthoniel,” surmises elvish music lacks emotion, Sauron is derived from the Greek for lizard, Tolkien’s art looks to be influenced by Beardsley, news of paperback The Hobbit published on August 5th, and news of the Tolkien Society of America.


Brooks, Jr., Cuyler Warnell. See also Brooks, Cuyler Warnell; Brooks, Ned


Brooks, Ned. See also Brooks, Jr., Cuyler Warnell; Brooks, Cuyler Warnell

Brooks, Rick
“A Round of Cards and Ale.” Yandro 151 (September 1965): 33. LoC. Sides with Ballantine Books, considers LR the best novel, suggests that Houghton Mifflin did not offer paperback rights because that publisher would have to pay royalties (where another would not).


“Laiskai.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 62. LoC. Wonders if Moorcock was influenced by Tolkien and briefly compares the fighting of evil between the two.

Brown, Charlie
“Laiskai.” Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965): 70-71. LoC. Disappointed that The Silmarillion will not be published soon and hopes to see Halevy’s glossary published.

Bucklin, Nate

Carey, Kris

Castoria, Phil
Untitled. Voice From A Hot Water Bottle 4 (January 1965): 2. APA comments on Opo [27?): Tolkien’s writing provides more than a story with a climax as he continues the story to a satisfying, complete ending.

Caughran, Jim
“Letter Litter.” Lighthouse 13 (August 1965): 34. LoC. Feels that Tolkien has no place in a discussion of science fiction.
Chambers, Johnny


Charter, George

“Laiskai.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 62. LoC. Does not like LR and has no use for Halevy’s glossary. Suggests that Tolkien must have created his own glossary, which could be published.

Coulson, Buck. See also Coulson, Robert; Coulson Robert S.


Coulson, Robert. See also Coulson, Buck; Coulson, Robert S.

“Laiskai.” Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965): 73. LoC. Cannot understand why anyone would bother with a glossary of Middle-earth, finding the whole exercise unnecessary.

Dicksheet, Dean


Divers Hands


Dominick, Margaret

“Wanted in trade.” Yandro 151 (December 1965): 10. Reader wants to trade for paperback LR.

Dorr, James

“A Round of Cards and Ale.” Yandro 151 (September 1965): 34. LoC. Would be surprised if Tolkien was upset over the loss of some royalties. Feels Ballantine will produce a better constructed paperback.

Dupla, Dr. Antonio


Ellingsworth, Dick


[Eney, Dick?]

“High Fly the Nazgûl - O.” Ring Cycle (September 1965): 4-5. Filk song. LR themed to the tune of “Green Grow the Rushes, O.”


Untitled. Ring Cycle (September 1965): 3. Poem or filk song about Sauron’s creation of the One Ring.

Untitled. Ring Cycle (September 1965): 5. Poem. Describes Uraks and compares them to science fiction fans.

16
Evers, E.E. See also Evers, Earl; Evers, Pfc. Earl E.; Evers, Pvt. Earl E.
“A Man’s Farewell to the Elvenlords.” Feemwlort 4 (December 1965): 20. Poem written about a man’s ambivalence at the passing of the Elves from Middle-earth.
Evers, Earl. See also Evers, E.E.; Evers, Pfc. Earl E.; Evers, Pvt. Earl E.
“Gincas.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 53-54. LoC. Comments on Fry’s article in Niekas 13. Sees Tolkien’s personal philosophy as related in the history of Middle-earth as something to be avoided when evaluating pillars of English literature. Tolkien’s Eurocentric and anti-technological model are outdated and are modern failures. Tolkien’s gods have all but abandoned Middle-earth as the elves are meant to do, leaving Men to their own devices.
Evers, Pfc. Earl E. See also Evers, E.E.; Evers, Earl; Evers, Pvt. Earl E.
“Laiskai.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 58-59. LoC. Cover of Niekas 12 inspires short prose touching on Numenor under the Sea. Offers correction for Halevy’s entry for Gríma. Thinks that wizards should be included in the entries of men (as Smeagol would be with the hobbits). Became a Tolkien fan after reading The Hobbit but its effect is very different than planned for a child reader.
Evers, Pvt. Earl E. See also Evers, E.E.; Evers, Earl; Evers, Pvt. Earl E.
Frazier, Leroy
“Amon Lhaw.” Entmoot 2 (October 1965): 4. LoC. Attempts to understand the context of “The breaking of Thangorodrim and the defeat of Morgoth.”
Frederick, Carl
Fry, Norman
“Tolkien & British Culture.” Niekas 13 (September 15, 1965): 13-14. Wonders if Tolkien’s LR will last as an icon of English Literature. Feels Tolkien’s appeal lies in his ability to make the flavor old Northern European tales accessible to a modern Eurocentric audience. Mentions a story in New Worlds SF by Bayley, which derives from Tolkien.
Garrison, Andrew
Gaughan, Jack
“Laiskai.” Niekas 13 (September 15, 1965): 38. LoC. Apologizes for the cover of the ACE TT (flying horse) due to time pressure to finish the illustration.
Glass, Bill
“Laiskai.” Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965): 73. LoC. Does not like Reynolds’ orcs but prefers his brother’s found in I Palantir 4.
Gold, Barry D.
Goodrich, James
“Another Round of Cards and Ale…..” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 29. LoC. Thinks that Wollheim should have worked with Tolkien personally to procure paperback rights.
Halevy, Al
“Laiskai.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 63. LoC. Provides history of his Middle-earth glossary as well as his motivation and justification to create it. Responds to corrections by Mebane, Mercer, Berman and others.
Hall, David
“A Window in Isengard.” Entmoot 1 ([June] 1965): 10. Regrets that the quality of the issue is poor and admits he could not read the tengwar he stencilled for the issue.
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965


Hall, Graham M.


Harness, Jack


Harrell, Phillip A.


Hay, George


Heap, Cindy


Heap, George

“An Epical Historie of the War of the Ring.” Ring Cycle (September 1965): 2. Folk song. The history of the One Ring set to the tune of “Jesse James.”

Hollander, Fred

“Amon Lhaw.” Entmoot 2 (October 1965): 5-6. LoC. Comments on the quality of Entmoot 1, elvish dictionaries, musical settings, and instruments used by elves, dwarves, men, and hobbits, and problems with film production of LR.


Isaac, John R.

“Grumblings.” Yandro 154 (December 1965): 20-21. LoC. Remembers reading in a past fanzine that Wollheim would not publish LR because it would not be economically feasible.

Jackson, Pete

“Laiskai.” Niekas 13 (September 15, 1965): 40. LoC. Has started reading LR along with his father.

Johnson, Barbi

“This ‘n That - letters of comment.” PASTell 17 (January 1965): 22. LoC. Has not read Tolkien but will borrow the books from Andre Norton.

Johnson, Seth A.


Lazaro, Ken


Leiber, Jr., Fritz


Lerner, Fred


Levitin, Alexis


Lewis, Al

“Pacificon II Art Show Report.” PASTell 17 (January 1965): 8-11. Mentions that Stopa’s artwork is showing more freedom in the Tolkien art displayed at Worldcon.

Linwood, Jhim

“Laiskai.” Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965): 68. LoC. Enjoyed The Hobbit but feels intimidated at starting LR.

Luc, Rick


Mandel, Mark


Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Maske, S.
“Laiskai.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 66. LoC. Tells of daughter who found LR frightening but (after reading it) found that all other stories are dull.

McCallum, John A.
“Grumblings.” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 23. LoC. States that British editions of Tolkien can be purchased in Canada or through importers.

Mebane, Banks. See also Mebane, Banks, and Greg Shaw
“Another Round of Cards and Ale…..” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 29. LoC. Agrees with Wollheim, if ACE had not published the paperback editions, someone else would and that blame should be placed with Houghton Mifflin.


“Laiskai.” Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965): 74. LoC. Has never found any appropriate rendering of an orc in artwork. Feels that Halevy’s glossary is less rushed but points out issues with it.

“Laiskai.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 60. LoC. Makes corrections to the Halevy glossary and states that the glossary is simply for the enjoyment of Tolkien fans.

Mebane, Banks, and Greg Shaw
“Amon Lhaw.” Entmoot 2 (October 1965): 3-4. LoC. Comments on impressions of music set to Tolkien’s poems (hobbits: German drinking songs; elves: Schubert lieder), character names are letters of the alphabet spelled phonetically, phonetic use of tengwar, criticism of Shaw’s poem for historical accuracy. Shaw responds about Bradley’s and Johnstone’s musical settings, possible Elvish instruments, and adaptability of folksongs to Tolkien’s poems.

“Skod Skudgy.” Feemwlort 3 (August 1965): 33-33 1/3. LoC. Shaw’s dictionary shows how Tolkien’s languages have inner consistency. Surmises that Tolkien created grammars and dictionaries. Discusses the Sindarin/Quenya words for ‘man’ (adan/atan). Shaw replies that much of Tolkien’s languages are untranslatable.

Meskys, Ed

“Bumbejimas: Of Tolkienish Things.” Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965): 77-78. Report on the ACE paperbacks (Wollheim was interviewed at a party). Wollheim speculated that the British publishers did not ‘register’ LR within the prescribed 18-month window and so lost copyright. Don Benson of Pyramid books asked Houghton Mifflin for years for paperback publication rights but was turned down, possibly because Houghton Mifflin knew they had no rights to sell. ACE did not plan to pay royalties. ACE plans on LR being a prestige book, published indefinitely, allowing them access to more markets (such as college bookstores). Comments on Gaughan’s covers. News of the New York Tolkien Society.


Norwood, Rick
“Another Round of Cards and Ale…..” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 29. LoC. Will not buy the ACE editions new out of deference to Tolkien but still is thankful that ACE forced the books to be published as paperbacks.

“Grumblings.” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 24. LoC. Writes about his 1938 edition of The Hobbit and compares it to the new Houghton Mifflin edition. At the 1965 Worldcon it was stated that The Silmarillion was already written but continues to be rewritten.

Paschelke, Larry

Patt, Stephen

Pelz, Bruce


“The Tolkien Society of America.” Ratatosk 19 (September 2, 1965): 1. Meeting announcement, which includes the troubles with ACE Books and the publication of The Silmarillion. Bill Mallardi planned to publish a booklet of Tolkien’s songs and poems from The Hobbit and LR.

Perrin, Steve

“Laiskai.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 63-64. LoC. Fry’s article in Niekas 13 has not much to say. The noble hero is an uncommon concept outside of the medieval chivalrous ideal. Does not find parallels between LR and Norse/Arthurian legends, which are dark and deadly.

Pettit, Billy H.
“Laiskai.” Niekas 11 (March 15, 1965): 62. LoC. Surprised at the following that Tolkien has, enough for interest in a glossary.

Plotz, Richard
“Activities of Members.” Tolkien Journal 1 (Spring 1965): 1. Planned activities are to create a correspondence between members and includes plea for members to read Tolkien’s books.


“Tolkien Notes from All Over.” Tolkien Journal 2 (Winterfilth 1965): 3. Bits and pieces: Brandywine Mushrooms, Dick Tedhams names his dog Samwise and daughter Arwen Elanor, a fanzine index planned, brother of the editor thinks he is Thorin, Bob Foster is working on a Tolkien index, Friends of J.R.R. Tolkien group formed, Esquire names Tolkien one of the best 100 people in the world, quote from Tolkien asking someone to explain why the Ballantine covers look the way they do.

Rein, Jr., Charles

Rolfe, Felice
“Grumblings.” Yandro 153 (November 1965): 20. LoC. Has good things to say about Shaw and his Entmoot. Finds the tit-for-tat between Wollheim and his detractors hilarious.


Sarno, Joe
“Another Round of Cards and Ale…..” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 30. LoC. Thinks that the contributors to the last issue’s column on the ACE/Ballantine controversy do not have Houghton Mifflin editions.

“Grumblings.” Yandro 153 (November 1965): 21. LoC. Feels LR is the most ambitious work of fantasy and compares to Wright’s Islandia.

“Grumblings.” Yandro 154 (December 1965): 18-19. LoC. Errata to his letter in Yandro 153. Describes meeting with Ackerman after the 1957 Worldcon where Ackerman showed 200 slides of landscapes and illustrations to be used as background to LR movie.

Scott, George
“Laiskai.” Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965): 67. LoC. Feels the review of Tree and Leaf from Niekas 9 was not a proper review.
Shaw, Greg. See also Mebane, Banks, and Greg Shaw; Simpson, Don and Greg Shaw; Stevens, Milton F., and Greg Shaw
“A Dictionary of the Elven Words from J.R.R. Tolkien’s Lord of the Rings.” Feemwlort 2 (June 1965): 31-44. List of songs, sayings, and elvish words and roots (a - lyg), including proper names with their translations, if known.
“Addendum.” Feemwlort 2 (June 1965): 16. Editorial ramblings about a party where the first paperback FR was seen and Tolkien music performed at the piano.
“Con-nerblings or Don’t Go Near the Edgewater or Tom Swift and His Electronic Westercon XVII.” Feemwlort 3 (August 1965): 7-19. Con report. Includes references to Tolkien inspired art in the art show and Simpson’s scheme of writing tengwar (see Entmoot 2).
“Editorial.” Entmoot 2 (October 1965): 15. Discusses the fate of The Fellowship of the Ring (including a letter by Pelz) and encourages people to contribute to I Palantir. Includes plea for material, including items written with Tolkien’s alphabets.
“Oh, Pshaw!: an editorial.” Feemwlort 1 (Spring 1965): 2-3. Writes about the tengwar in the issue, his interest in Tolkien’s alphabets, and in publishing a Tolkien fanzine. States he created an Elvish dictionary.
Untitled. Feemwlort 1 (Spring 1965): 13. Plea (in tengwar) for those interested in tengwar to write the editor.
Shir-Cliff, Bernard
“Grumblings” Yandro 149 (July 1965): 23. LoC. Ballantine Books representative explains that Tolkien’s copyrights were unprotected due to a loophole in the U.S. copyright law, Tolkien receives no royalties on the ACE editions of LR, and that Ballantine and Houghton Mifflin will be publishing an authorized, revised edition at the latter part of 1965.
“Grumblings.” Yandro 150 (August 1965): 19-20. LoC. Discusses the grassroots firestorm due to the ACE editions. Tolkien’s illness had delayed the publication of the Ballantine editions of LR but The Hobbit was published.
Sieger, James
“Another Round of Cards and Ale…..” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 30. LoC. Says Wollheim has explained his actions in The New York Times Book Review and his offer for royalty/honorarium was not answered by Tolkien.
Simpson, Don and Greg Shaw
Singleton, Peter
Solon, Ben
“Grumblings.” Yandro 154 (December 1965): 23-24. LoC. Feels Wollheim was within his rights to publish LR but doesn’t like the quality of the editions or the incorrect page references in footnotes. Feels that Tolkien was more interested in the courtesy of being informed than the money “…anyone who takes fifteen years to write a novel is not in it for the money…”

“Laiskai.” *Niekas* 14 (December 10, 1965): 66. LoC. Does not agree with Fry that Tolkien had any underlying philosophical motive when writing *LR*. Finds it incredulous that *LR* was not influenced by World War II. The hobbits are the only creatures that have commonality with modern man.


Staus, Becker


Stevens, Milton F., and Greg Shaw

“Skod Skudgy.” *Feemwlort* 3 (August 1965): 33 2/3. LoC. A new reader of *LR* and is surprised at the Tolkien fan scholarship. Suggests that Tolkien fans explore Anglo-Saxon literature for sources. Shaw responds that many of Tolkien’s names have Anglo-Saxon sources.

Tackett, Roy

“A Round of Cards and Ale.” *Yandro* 151 (September 1965): 34. LoC. Indifferent about ACE/Ballantine controversy. Had to order copies of *LR* because they were unavailable in Albuquerque.

Thewlis, Dave


Toren, James

“Skodskudgy.” *Feemwlort* 4 (December 1965): 13. LoC. After reading *The Hobbit* and *LR*, does not understand how anyone could hate the books.

Trimble, Bjo


[Trimble, Bjo?]

“Art Show Awards - 1964.” *PASTell* 17 (January 1965): 6-7. Fellowship of the Ring award given at the Worldcon had honorable mentions given to Cawthorn and Stopa (Stopa was also fifth in the Popular Award voting for another Tolkien piece).

Tucker, Bob

“Another Round of Cards and Ale….” *Yandro* 152 (October 1965): 29. LoC. Suggests reviewing the Chicago Daily News (10/9/65) letter column for pro-Ballantine views.

Unknown


Unwin, R.S.

Untitled. *Niekas* 11 (March 15, 1965): 40. Explains that The Silmarillion is in an unpublishable state and years away from completion but Tolkien’s English version of “Sir Gawain and the Green Knight” and “Pearl” might be published by year’s end.

Van Arnam, Dave


Viggiano, Michael

“Skod Skudgy.” *Feemwlort* 3 (August 1965): 34. LoC. Feels that all of the in-depth attention of *LR* will scare away potential readers.


“Laiskai.” *Niekas* 13 (September 15, 1965): 40. LoC. Finally read *LR* but does not have use for Halevy’s or Shaw’s glossaries. Found ACE *LR* in sf/fantasy as well as literature section of a college bookstore. Heard that there was a Tolkien cult at Harvard.

Walsted, Mark


Warner, Harry. See also Warner, Jr., Harry

“Skod Skudgy.” *Feemwlort* 3 (August 1965): 27-28. LoC. Suggests that those who work on Tolkien linguistics to send their efforts to Tolkien. Wonders if Tolkien’s languages are synthetic or adapted. Thinks elvish looks Finnish.
Warner, Jr., Harry. See also Warner, Harry
“Amon Lhaw.” Entmoot 1 ([June] 1965): 3-4. LoC. Describes how Bruce Pelz had set Tolkien’s poetry to music. Muses on what type of instrumental accompaniment might be used and the type of metre of the songs. Notes that some character names are letters of the alphabet spelled phonetically. Not overly fond of Tolkien as writer.

“Laiskai.” Niekas 11 (March 15, 1965): 69. LoC. Finds in Niekas 10 that de Maiffe’s drawing of Gimli better than most Tolkien art but finds Zelazny’s poem emotionless. Remarks that the dwarvish name Nain is also French for dwarf.

“Laiskai.” Niekas 14 (December 10, 1965): 64. LoC. Tolkien will not cause people to be interested in older tales. LR will blend into the background and will not be one of the century’s most influential books.

West, D.
“Another Round of Cards and Ale…..” Yandro 152 (October 1965): 29-30. LoC. Finds Houghton Mifflin to blame about the copyright loss. An academic question in Britian as the only LR editions available are the normal and deluxe.

West, R.C.

Westbrooke, Horace

White, Ted
“Grumblings.” Yandro 153 (November 1965): 15-20. LoC. Responds to Wollheim’s criticism of White’s criticism of Wollheim. Brings up the topic of the ACE LR and believes that Wollheim never offered an honorarium to Tolkien or his representatives.

Wollheim, Don A.
“Grumblings.” Yandro 150 (August 1965): 19. LoC. Takes exception of Shir-Cliff’s comments on the ACE paperbacks of LR. Notes that the books aren’t pirated since they were not copyrighted in the U.S. and Houghton Mifflin was contacted before by publishers to issue editions in paperback. Tolkien offered royalties or an honorarium by ACE and that the additional cost of the Ballantine edition cannot be justified by stating that they pay royalties.

“Grumblings.” Yandro 154 (December 1965): 19-20. LoC. Notes that Tolkien and his publishers never mentioned money in their complaints to ACE but that ACE did not inform them ahead of time. Writes that in a BBC interview Tolkien stated he would turn down money from ACE. Feels that the Unwins had no faith in Tolkien’s work, which accounted for the need for Tolkien to underwrite LR and, therefore, would not cover the cost to maintain its copyright.

“The Ace Tolkiens.” Lighthouse 13 (August 1965): 16-18. Justification over the ACE editions of LR. Knew that the books carried no copyright originally (but later carried the Berne copyright, which did not apply in the U.S.). Blames Tolkien’s publisher or agent that allowed this to happen. ACE and other paperback publishers requested paperback rights from Houghton Mifflin, but were refused. ACE decided to publish them after the success of (and copyright research resulting from) publishing of the Edgar Rice Burroughs paperback editions. States that ACE will pay Tolkien and feels that Tolkien will come out better in the end with increased prestige and income.

Wood, Ed

Wood, Robin
“Laiskai.” Niekas 12 (June 15, 1965): 73. LoC. Notes that Halevy’s glossary highlights the vast number of names invented by Tolkien.

Wright, James
“Amon Lhaw.” Entmoot 1 ([June] 1965): 4. LoC. Feels the sound of Tolkien names are appropriate to his characters. Believes that LR will never be filmed or appear in paperback. Comments on The Adventures of Tom Bombadil.

23
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Artist index

Cawthorn, Jim
“Eowyn and the Nazgûl.”  Amra v. 2:36 (September 1965): 20.  Êowyn, Lord of the Nazgûl, Nazgûl’s flying beast, Snowmane, Théoden

Gaughan, Jack

Holmberg, John-Henry

Paxton, Diana L.

Pelz, Dian
“Just a minute, I’ll see if he’s in his office.”  Ratatosk 22 (October 24, 1965): 1.  Lord of the Nazgûl

Reynolds, Bill
“Smaug.”  Feemwlort 1 (Spring 1965): cover.  Smaug
Untitled.  Feemwlort 2 (June 1965): cover.  Frodo Baggins, Gollum, The Ring
Untitled.  Feemwlort 3 (August 1965): cover.  Êowyn, Lord of the Nazgûl, Nazgûl’s flying beast
Untitled.  Entmoot 2 (October 1965): cover.  Frodo Baggins, Gollum
Untitled.  Entmoot 2 (October 1965): cover.  The Eye
Untitled.  Entmoot 2 (October 1965): 2.  Gollum
Untitled.  Entmoot 2 (October 1965): 15.  The Eye

Staus, Becker
Tolkien Fandom Review: 1965

Art index by subject

Aragorn II

Baggins, Frodo

Éowyn

The Eye

Gamgee, Samwise

Gollum

Grond

Hobbits

Lord of the Nazgûl
  Pelz, Dian. “Just a minute, I’ll see if he’s in his office.” Ratatosk 22 (October 24, 1965): 1.

Minas Morgul

Morgul Vale

Nazgûl’s flying beast

Orcs

Palamitr

The Ring

Smaug

Snowmane

Théoden
Treebeard
ADDENDA (1956-1964)

A Few Comments about the Fanzines Covered

Calmatéma. Published in Berkeley, California, by Karen Anderson for The Cult.
Science Fiction Parade. Published in Bell Gardens, California, by Len J. Moffatt; independent.
The Twilight Zine. Published in Cambridge, Massachusetts, by Bernie Morris for the MIT Science Fiction Society.

Fanzines

1956

Science Fiction Parade 3 (November-December 1956)
Sinclare, Anna. "Reply to a Heckler." 5. Tolkien can be classified as science fiction because his intelligent beings have the ability to move to different vistas and because unlimited reality exists in his stories.

1959

Calmatéma 1 ([1959])
Anderson, Karen "The Tengwar." 3. Explanation of tengwar, including use as an orthographic system (rather than an alphabet) and how the tehtar differ between Quenya and Sindarin.

1963

The Twilight Zine 9 (January 30, 1963)
Morris, Bernie. "On a Wind-Rocked Tree: Lord of the Rings and the Epic." 14-22. Finds parallels between characters and themes in Tolkien’s world and Norse mythology. Gives examples of Gandalf/Odin, Saruman/Loki, evil inherent in the One Ring/Alberich’s ring, Narsil/Gram, Aragorn as epic hero, Gollum/Andvari (Alberich), and cyclical ages. Also, draws similarities between the Elves and Tuatha De Danann, and hobbits and the English middle-class. Sources cited include the Volsunga Saga, Wagner’s Ring Cycle, and The Elder Edda.

Author index

Anderson, Karen
"The Tengwar." Calmatéma 1 ([1959]) 3. Explanation of tengwar, including use as an orthographic system (rather than an alphabet) and how the tehtar differ between Quenya and Sindarin.

Morris, Bernie
"On a Wind-Rocked Tree: Lord of the Rings and the Epic." The Twilight Zine 9 (January 30, 1963) 14-22. Finds parallels between characters and themes in Tolkien’s world and Norse mythology. Gives examples of Gandalf/Odin, Saruman/Loki, evil inherent in the One Ring/Alberich’s ring, Narsil/Gram, Aragorn as epic hero, Gollum/Andvari (Alberich), and cyclical ages. Also, draws similarities between the Elves and Tuatha De Danann, and hobbits and the English middle-class. Sources cited include the Volsunga Saga, Wagner’s Ring Cycle, and The Elder Edda.

Sinclare, Anna
"Reply to a Heckler." Science Fiction Parade 3 (November-December 1956): 5. Tolkien can be classified as science fiction because his intelligent beings have the ability to move to different vistas and because unlimited reality exists in his stories.
Ephemera

1960


circa 1961


Errata

Tolkien Fandom Review from its beginnings to 1964

Pages 7 and 18, Niekas 5 publication date should be June 15, 1963 (not 1961). Thanks to Jeremy Edmonds.
Glossary

APA (Amateur Press Association): A group of people who publish fanzines, and instead of mailing them individually, sends them to an Official Editor, who distributes them to members in identical bundles.

APA L: Weekly APA, which was started by fans from the Los Angeles area
The Cult: North American APA, which only allowed 13 members
FAPA: Fantasy Amateur Press Association
N'APA: Neffer Amateur Press Association, a part of the National Fantasy Fan Federation (NFFF or N3F)
OMPA: Offtrail Magazine Publishers' Association
SAPS: Spectator Amateur Press Society

Filk song: Fannish folk song, often a parody of a mundane folk song.
LoC: Letter of comment, on an issue of a fanzine, sometimes in lieu of subscription or trade.

S&S (Sword & Sorcery): genre of fiction; a Conan the Barbarian story would be S&S.

Worldcon (World Science Fiction Convention): annual sf convention held over Labor Day weekend.

1958: 16th in South Gate, California “Solacon”
1959: 17th in Detroit “Detention”
1960: 18th in Pittsburgh “Pittcon”
1961: 19th in Seattle “Seacon”
1962: 20th in Chicago “Chicon III”
1964: 22nd in Oakland “Pacificon II”

Bibliography

All fanzines referenced above.
Personal correspondence with Dick Plotz.
http://fanac.org/Fannish_Reference_Works/FandBook/FandBook.html